Chapter II

The Intabulated Lute Accompaniments to

English Cavalier Songs 1630-1670

This chapter will examine the surviving continuo song accompaniments with lute tablature from this period. The songs with intabulated accompaniments make up a very small portion of the overall repertory, about two hundred, compared to more than fifteen hundred songs with unfigured or partially figured bass. The eight intabulated accompaniments will be analyzed to gain an overview of the great variety of stylistic elements used by lutenists of this period. The analysis will also look at aspects of instrumentation, including the use and tuning of the three different lutes employed throughout this period, as well as their possible use in combinations with other accompanying instruments. In chapter IV elements of these stylistic features will be used to create lute continuo realizations of songs published without tablature.

From the 1620s onward, song manuscripts may survive with an unfigured bass line, with an intabulated lute part, or with both. As the century progressed, the surviving tablature accompaniments became less numerous as lutenists apparently developed fluency in continuo realization. Collections often include a mixture of songs with tablature accompaniments and others having only an unfigured bass. Often the same song survives with an intabulated accompaniment in one source, but with a continuo bass line instead in another. This plurality makes it seem unlikely that the notation of the accompaniment – intabulated versus bass line – indicates a different accompanimental style. It is more likely that the decision on whether to intabulate or not was based solely on
the level of the lute player’s ability to realize continuo from a bass line.

Exceptions to this theory apply to manuscripts prepared by the composers themselves. Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Mus. b.1, (the John Wilson manuscript) is a presentation manuscript prepared under the direction of John Wilson, who was himself the scribe for the tablature realization in it. Broxbourne 49.9 and Lambeth Palace MS 1041 both feature autographs by Charles Coleman. Many of the accompaniments in these three manuscripts are beyond the abilities of the average student. They probably do not represent an implication that the reader would be unable to realize continuo; it is more likely that they are intended to preserve examples of ideal accompaniments by master composers.

The intabulated lute accompaniments from the 1630s through the 1670s are important because they supply a written-out account of the transition from the Elizabethan lute song into a period when accompaniments were mostly improvised. They document the growth of an accompaniment style that responded to the new declamatory vocal style of composers like Wilson, Lanier and the Lawes brothers. In addition, they reflect the ongoing modifications in lute construction that took place during the seventeenth century in England – from 10-course lute to 12-course lute to 13-course theorbo with re-entrant top string. The analysis that follows separates the manuscripts into categories based on the instruments for which they were composed and presents them in roughly chronological order. It will concentrate on identifying important elements of accompaniment style in the eight song collections.
Analysis

Manuscripts with tablature accompaniments for 10-course lute

New York Public Library, Drexel MS 4175 (*Ann Twice, Her Book*)

Dated by watermarks, this manuscript was written before 1630 and includes six songs with tablature accompaniment for 10-course lute, as well as several additional songs with intabulated accompaniment for viol. There are notated ornaments in all of the lute tablature accompaniments.

Example 2.1, *Dear, do not your fair beauty*, Robert Johnson, Drexel MS 4175, p. xli, mm. 1-5:

---

1 For a detailed description of this manuscript see John P. Cutts, “Songs Unto the Violl and Lute – Drexel MS 4175,” *Musica Disciplina*, vol. 16 (1962), pp. 73-92.
The ornament symbols “x” and “,” are used, with the former probably a fore-fall (appoggiatura from below), and the latter in the position where a back-fall (appoggiatura from above) would be expected. The symbol “,” sometimes appears with a single or double dot following it (,. or ;), and these symbols may indicate the addition of ascending shakes (trills) after the back-fall.\(^2\)

The vertical line “|” appears in other songs such as *Cloris sighte, and sange, and wepte*, and is called a “beat” by Thomas Mace. He describes its performance as a prolonged trill to the fret a half step below the written note.\(^3\) In the opening of *Cloris* the beat is placed on the first chord, and if it were struck repeatedly as Mace suggests, it would have the effect of sustaining the harmony throughout the entire measure. The symbol is used again on the second chord of measure four, this time to emphasize the dissonance between the vocal melody and its accompaniment on the word “singing.”

These are typical uses of this ornament throughout the manuscript.


Example 2.2, *Cloris sighte, and sange, and wepte*, Alphonso Bales?, Drexel MS 4175, p. lii, mm. 1-5:

Transcription:

Drexel MS 4175 suggests that an accompaniment with a variety of little graces might have been acceptable by some lutenists. In addition to Thomas Mace’s *Musick’s*
Monument, other sources can provide additional information about ornamentation, even though they do not refer specifically to accompaniments.⁴

In the viol tablature accompaniments that follow the pieces with lute accompaniment in the same manuscript, the viol plays mainly a bass line, with occasional thirds, chords, and cadential figures. There are very few ornament signs in the viol intabulations, which suggests another possible function for the ornaments in the lute accompaniments. While ornaments can be simply decorative, they can also be used to prevent the sound of the instrument from dying away on a long note value. Using ornaments can add support by drawing more sound from the instrument, shading dynamics and sustaining the accompaniment under the voice. Use of ornaments for this purpose in the viol accompaniments would not be necessary due to the sustaining nature of the instrument.

Thomas Robinson’s comments on lute ornamentation seem pertinent to this point (this author’s bold):

… and note that the longer the time of a single stroke, that the more need it hath of a relish, for a relish will help, both to grace it, and also to continue the sound of the note its full time: but in a quicke time a little touch or jerke will serve, and that onely with the most strongest finger.⁵

Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Mus. Sch. f.575

These songs for lute and voice are part of volume seven in a 10-volume collection of mostly instrumental music given to Christ Church, Oxford by a Mr. William Illes in 1673.

⁴ Two sources that may have direct bearing on this subject are the instructions in Schoole of Musicke (1603) by Thomas Robinson and Secretum Musarum (1615) by Nicholas Vallet, but in both are quite brief compared to Mace’s discussion of ornaments.

⁵ Robinson, op. cit., p. 8.
The songs appear to date from the 1630s, but no definitive date can be assigned. Volume seven includes ten songs for 10-course lute with tablature accompaniments, eighty-five pieces for lyra-viol by John Jenkins, Simon Ives, William Lawes and others, and five pieces for keyboard by Orlando Gibbons. Of the ten intabulated lute songs, five are in the standard G tuning, four are in nominal A tuning, and one is in nominal D tuning. The concept of nominal tuning assumes that the pitch of the lute does not change from song to song, but that the vocal part transposes to match the lute pitch, instead of the lute player retuning or using a different instrument. For example, if the voice part of a song is written one tone above the pitch that the lute will sound in its normal G tuning, the voice would simply shift down a tone to match the lute, rather than the lute moving to A tuning to meet the voice. Nominal tuning may have been used for a number of reasons: 1) to allow the vocal part to avoid ledger lines and remain within the staff; or 2) to keep the vocal part away from key signatures involving three flats, keys that were not universally recognized in the music theory of the day as applied to mensural notation, but that were possible on the lute.\(^6\)

There is infrequent use of the top string of the lute, but when it is used, it seems to function best in the higher tuning. Seven of the songs use bar lines; three do not. If the lack of bar lines indicates a performance style, then perhaps these songs should be played with a less measured approach. The accompaniments are neatly copied, without mistakes or corrections. Block chords predominate, and are often repeated verbatim when the notes are repeated in the bass line. The following excerpt from *Eyes, gaze no more* shows this straightforward block chord texture as well as a final cadence formula that is used throughout the collection:

---

\(^6\) Many examples of nominal tuning implying transposition of the vocal line can be seen in the *airs de cour* for voice and lute published by Robert Ballard from 1603 to 1643.
Example 2.3, *Eyes gaze no more*, Anonymous, Bodleian f.575, f. 6v, mm. 9-17:
The cadence starting in the penultimate measure shows the formulaic 3-4-4-3 melodic activity starting on the note B, coupled with the descent from 8 to 7 on the last half-measure. In the 3-4-4-3 cadence, the third quarter note where the 4 is struck against the 5 (notes C and D respectively) is the strongest moment, with the resolution to 3 relaxing the tension. Variations on the above cadence include the use of the 6/4 chord resolving to 5/3, 6/4 to 5/4 to 5/3, and one plain cadence of root position chords (5/3-5/3) as shown in example 2.4, but the cadence illustrated above is by far the most common.
Example 2.4, other cadence figures in Bodleian f.575:

The accompaniments in Bodleian f.575 could have been played by a beginning student. They contain all the basic elements of an accompaniment: harmonic support in the form of block chords for beginnings and middles of phrases, and simple cadences for phrase endings.

Oxford, Bodleian MS Don.c.57

This manuscript, dated circa 1640, is probably for 10-course lute, although there is indiscriminate and probably incorrect use of the tablature symbol for the eleventh course. All of the intabulations and the diagram of chords are at the end of the manuscript with the songs for unfigured bass in the beginning. Composers represented include Henry Lawes and John Wilson.

The scribal error confusing the tenth and eleventh courses, combined with other obvious tablature errors indicates that the writer was an inexperienced student. Chord voicings often seem awkward and arbitrary. There are many corrections, with entire chords scratched out and rewritten by the original hand in the manner of a student correcting his or her work.
Of the thirteen songs in the manuscript, three have a separate bass line written at the bottom of the page. The question of why these bass lines were included with some songs and not others is intriguing, and the answer may hinge on the nominal tuning of the voice compared to the lute in the various songs, as mentioned earlier in this chapter.

In ten of the songs the voice matches the normal G tuning. Three are in nominal A tuning compared to the voice (that is, the vocal part is written one tone higher than the lute part). Two of the three songs in A tuning have a bass line provided, which the player could have used to improvise a transposed accompaniment. The player would simply have to read the bass line using the G tuning – the standard lute tuning for this period – and he or she would be able to realize the accompaniment up a tone from what the tablature implies. The third song in nominal A tuning, Sing sing Syren, does not have room on the page to add a bass line, so none appears. This theory of a bass line used for transposition is brought into question by the fact that one song in G tuning, How wretched is, has a bass line inserted on the facing page where there is some extra room. Whether these added bass lines were intended as a reference for transposition by the intabulator, or as a part for another instrument such as the bass viol, they are instructive because they show the lute intabulation’s pitch relationship to the bass line. Shall I despaire of my resolv’d intent is one of the songs in nominal A tuning, and it has a mensural bass line written out underneath the intabulated accompaniment. In the accompaniment some liberty is taken in the intabulation regarding restriking long notes and octave transposition compared to the bass line. Throughout the song the notes above E in the bass clef are transposed down an octave, possibly to make use of the resonant low range on the lute. In the transcription of example 2.5, the song has been transcribed down a tone so that the melody matches the
lute in G tuning and the bass line has been put into the same key for easy comparison. The discrepancies between the bass line and the bass of the lute tablature are evident.

Example 2.5, *Shall I despaire of my resolved intent*, Anonymous, Bodleian Don. c.57, p. 98:
Transcription:

Some corrections were made in the above transcription: the harmony requires a D in the bass of the first chord of the tablature realization rather than A₉, and the four eighth notes in measure seven of the bass line sound more correct transposed up a tone. This mistransposition in measure seven of the bass could have occurred if the scribe was devising the bass line from the tablature, since a line break occurs in the song at this point, a place where scribal mistakes often occur.
Although Bodleian Don. c.57 is probably the work of a student, it is worth studying because of the issues surrounding the additional bass lines in some of the songs in it. Their possible relation to transposition has been addressed above; the implication that an additional bass line instrument might have been used will be explored further in this chapter.

The manuscript also contains a page entitled “Stops upon the theorbo” containing simple cadences and chord shapes that a beginning continuo student might write out for reference. The accompaniments themselves are freely adapted to the student’s elementary technique, and were surely a work in progress.

New Haven, Yale University Filmer MS A.14

It is not clear that Filmer A.14 is an English manuscript, as it contains only one song in English. Dated between 1640 and 1660, the manuscript contains nine Italian songs, four French, one Latin, and one English. In addition to the songs for which both melody and tablature accompaniment are provided, there are three songs without the bass, two movements of Sonata Opus 2 No.1 by Corelli, and some unidentified instrumental music. A 10-course lute in standard Renaissance tuning seems to be the best choice overall, but the English song requires an eleventh course tuned to B♭. The style of accompaniment is very rhythmic, with many broken chords, and it is consistent throughout, no matter what the language of the text is. In many cases, multiple verses of a song have been completely set to music rather than simply writing out the text at the bottom of the page. Several songs have short introductions and interludes between verses that are more chordal and rhythmic than they are melodic, like the accompaniments themselves.

---

7 Dr. Gordon Callon informed me by e-mail in November of 2003 that the provenance of Filmer MS. A. 14 has not been determined, nor are there concordances with other songs.
For the most part there is no rhythmic notation in the tablature accompaniment. If the scribe, singer, and accompanist were the same person, the tablature and its approximate placement under the text would have been more than sufficient for performance, but to an outsider’s eye, the rhythm is sometimes hard to decipher. The non-rhythmic spacing of the text indicates that it was probably copied first. Since the text takes up most of the space between the vocal staff and the tablature, the rhythmic signs were not included; there was simply no room. If there was conscious intent behind their omission, it might have been to imply a flexible, free approach to playing the accompaniment, or that the rhythm could have been changed to fit the character of subsequent verses. In the experience of this player, working from this manuscript is a challenge and demands a different kind of listening, with heightened awareness of the vocal part.

Example 2.6 is the single song in English from the manuscript. This writer has supplied a solution to the rhythms of the accompaniment, but other choices are possible.
Example 2.6, Peace, peace, you lowde violins, Anonymous, Filmer MS A.14,

f. 19v-20, mm 1-9:
While Filmer MS A.14 is of dubious provenance and may not represent typical English song accompaniment, it is significant because it provides examples in a continuously broken chordal style that is usually associated with the accompaniment of the French *air de cour*. The inclusion of one English song in the manuscript introduces the possibility that this style could have been familiar to English lutenists.
Manuscripts with tablature accompaniments for 12-course lute

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Mus. b.1 (John Wilson MS).

John Wilson (1595-1673) took part in the preparation of this manuscript to be presented to the Bodleian Library in 1656, the year he was named Heather Professor of Music at Oxford. This document is of great importance because it is the unique source for many songs by Wilson, and because it represents his direct efforts rather than simply those of a student or publisher. It contains 188 songs with only an unfigured bass and thirty-eight songs with both tablature and an unfigured bass. The last twenty-one intabulated songs are on Latin texts by Horace and Ovid. Of the thirty-eight intabulated accompaniments, four are for lute in nominal A tuning, the notational convention discussed earlier where the vocal line transposes up one whole step to meet the pitch of the lute tablature. At the beginning of the manuscript, before the songs, there are several pages of chord studies for lute, followed by twenty-seven solo lute voluntaries in a variety of keys.

The accompaniments in this manuscript appear to be particularly well crafted, and the source has the advantage of presenting both the bass line and the intabulated realization in score format. This is especially helpful when the bass line and the intabulation diverge for brief moments, making it clear when the intabulator opted for a different octave, or in some cases, a substituted bass line. The realizations are often in two- and three-voice counterpoint, in a style reminiscent of the Golden Age lute song. As in Bodleian Doc. c.57, this manuscript raises the question of the purpose of the bass line – whether it implies the use of a viol, either along with, or in place of the lute. That issue will be addressed at the end of this chapter.

---

Several compositional features stand out that require a discussion of the tuning of Wilson’s instrument. The tessitura of the intabulated accompaniments emphasizes the middle and lower range of the lute, making very little use of the first course. When used, this course seems to function best at the higher octave, although there are some instances that seem to indicate a re-entrant tuning – an octave lower – for it.

Example 2.7, Standard vs. re-entrant tuning of the first course:

Standard Renaissance lute tuning for the first course:

![Standard Renaissance lute tuning](image)

English theorbo tuning with re-entrant first course:

![English theorbo tuning](image)

If it is assumed that the lute used for these songs had the capabilities to play higher notes on the first course, one must ask why these higher pitches were not used more frequently. The most plausible answer seems to be that the resonant low and middle registers were favored by Wilson, both when the lute was in an accompaniment role, and when performing solos, such as the twenty-seven voluntaries at the beginning of the manuscript. It is interesting that Wilson often intabulates the note G on the fifth fret of the second course (tablature $f$) rather than simply placing it on the open string of the first course (tablature $a$):
Example 2.8, Higher positions on the second course instead of using the first course:

This suggests one of three possibilities: 1) that Wilson might have preferred the covered sound of the fretted note rather than a ringing open string, 2) that he might have used a lowered first course, or 3) that the first course was made up of two strings tuned an octave apart, although that seems unlikely, since there is no evidence from a seventeenth century source that this tuning was employed:

Example 2.9, 12-course tuning with first course octaves:

The split-octave tuning would solve many voice leading problems. Perhaps Wilson and some of the other lutenist composers were ambiguous on this point because the octave in which this string sounded and the resulting inversions of chords and scale passages that would result were details with which they simply were not concerned. For the purposes of this study, transcriptions of Wilson’s work will assume the standard Renaissance tuning for the 12-course lute, not the re-entrant or octave tuning for the first course. For clarity,
the upper octaves produced by the octave stringing of the diapasons are not notated in the
transcription, but their presence should be understood in all cases.

There is a very free approach to octave transposition of the bass line in the intabulated
accompaniments. Even though a 12-course lute has the requisite high courses to play full
chords in the upper range, that effect is used only part of the time. Much of the writing
takes advantage of the rich middle and low range of the instrument, by transposing the
bass down one and sometimes two octaves, as we will see in some of the following
elements.

In many places the intabulated lute part contains a re-composition of, or an addition
to, the bass line that appears in staff notation. The following excerpt from *No, I will
sooner trust* shows both of these elements. Embellishment of the bass line is common, for
example, the two eighth notes leading to measure two of example 2.10. Measures four and
five are recomposed to create two consecutive 7-6 suspensions, with the written bass
omitted in the lute realization. The accompaniment also makes use of unisons on adjacent
strings in measures three and five. In both instances, the note F is produced on both
strings, allowing that pitch to ring through as the note is changed on the other string. The
result is a rich, almost harp-like dissonance as the F and E ring together.
Example 2.10, *No, no, I will sooner trust*, John Wilson, Bodleian MS Mus. b.1, f. 142v, mm. 11-16:

Transcription:
In Example 2.11, *Thou greate and good*, there is a more significant recomposition of the bass of the lute part. The realization adds a pedal point C in the final measure of the song, and dispenses with the notes of the mensural bass line altogether. The treble of the lute part keeps the shape of this missing bass line, shadowing the vocal line in parallel thirds. This choice capitalizes on the sonorous diapason courses of the lute, which might have been strung in octaves. It is clear from this example that it would have been unlikely for the lute part and bass line to have been played together as an accompaniment to the song; doing so would have created parallel fifths between the bass line and upper voice of the lute in beats five to eight of the last measure.

Example 2.11, *Thou greate and good*, John Wilson, Bodleian MS Mus. b.1, f. 147r, mm. 15-16:
Contrapuntal activity occurs throughout the texture of the accompaniments.

The independent motion of the voices between the bass line and the vocal part can generally be observed throughout this entire collection of intabulated songs. When the bass moves by step in quarter note values, parallel thirds, tenths and sixths are common.

Bassline motion by step in slower note values is often realized with parallel thirds and with the use of suspensions from a tone above. This movement of 4 to 3 over the bass, typically associated with a cadence, has an ornamental function since here the bass does not resolve in the manner of a cadence. These suspensions of 4 to 3 also appear as ornaments to stepwise progressions of 6/3 chords as well, creating double appoggiaturas of 6/4 to 6/3 as in measure three of Example 2.12 from *Foolish lover, goe*. The treble part of the lute accompaniment creates an expressive dissonance against the vocal part:
Example 2.12, *Foolish lover, goe*, Anonymous, Bodleian MS Mus. b.1, f. 140r, mm. 8-15:

Transcription:

While a voice within the accompaniment can be used to create harmonic tension against the vocal line, it can also respond to melodic shapes in the vocal part. Example 2.13 is part of Wilson’s setting of *Epode 2* by the Latin poet Horace, a longer work that extends for five pages. The most notable features here are the passages of parallel sixths and thirds between the upper line of the lute part and the vocal line. This texture occurs at the end of both of the two major parts of the song, where a dominant pedal point is introduced.
Example 2.13, *Epode 2*, John Wilson, Bodleian MS Mus. b.1, ff. 191v-195r, part 1, mm. 75-79:

Transcription:

In example 2.13, motion by parallel sixths (literally thirteenths) is used leading into the first complete measure of the excerpt. After that the interval of a third (tenth) is used fairly consistently, interrupted by full chords only at moments of metric stress in the text, such as “Pa-vi-DUM-que,” “LA-que-o,” “GRU-em,” and “iu-CUN-da.” The parallel motion is an effective way to accompany over a pedal point; it reinforces the direction of the vocal melody while the pedal, played by the thumb, creates a repeating rhythmic and
harmonic impulse. It is worth noting that the pedal point in the lute part is broken into smaller note values compared to the bass line, a testimony to the need for restriking notes that fade out quickly on the lute. Another use of this style of accompaniment, the setting of a line in parallel motion to the vocal melody, can be seen in at the conclusion of Charles Coleman’s *Wake my Adonis*, below.⁹ Coleman used figures rather than tablature to indicate the voice moving parallel to the vocal melody.

Example 2.14, *Wake my Adonis*, Charles Coleman, *Select Musical Ayres and Dialogs*, p. 26, mm. 41-46:

⁹ Charles Coleman, in *Select Musicall Ayres and Dialogues, In Three Bookes* (1653), (London: John Playford, 1653) p. 26
Possible realization:

Sometimes the composed voice or voices in the accompaniment can have a pictorial function. The music historian Vincent Duckles cites an excellent example of text painting in an inner voice by describing the ending of *Stay, fairest Clarissa*, which is shown in example 2.15.

Here with obvious pictorial intent the lute part descends to the earth while the voice rises to the stars, creating a spread of three octaves between the solo and the lute bass.¹⁰

The song text, comparing the heavenly attributes of Clarissa to the baseness of life on Earth without her, is well served by this musical device:

---

Wilson’s final and important sectional cadences show a rather narrow range of variation, but they are carefully composed in terms of voice leading and are worth looking at in more detail as examples to be emulated. For lack of seventeenth-century terminology, the names subdominant, dominant, and tonic will be used to describe the chords on the fourth, fifth, and first scale degrees. Almost all cadences in Wilson’s songs with the exception of two plagal (subdominant to tonic) cadences in two of the Latin settings, make use of the progression of subdominant, dominant, and tonic. Occasional variations in this progression occur: example 2.15A omits the subdominant and creates finality by a repetition of the dominant – tonic progression starting from the G# in the bass. Example
2.15C borrows from the parallel minor, with a B♭ in the subdominant built on G. The subdominants can be root position triads, but more often contain an appoggiatura of 6/3 to 5/3 harmonies as in examples 2.15A and 2.15B.

The dominant chord is decorated with some variety, the most common being the 4-#3 suspension as in 2.15A, with #3-4-4-#3 as a close second in popularity. Somewhat less common is the use of the full dominant seventh chord, either struck together, or broken artfully with suspensions and arpeggios, as in 2.15B. In all these cases, voice leading at cadences carefully avoids doubling the vocal line and, in most cases, does not even include the voice’s note within the chord. In addition, the accompaniment typically sets up rhythmic contrast against the vocal line during the dominant chord, as in 2.15A and 2.15B. Example 2.15C is unusual in that the vocal line climbs to the tonic from the raised seventh scale degree instead of descending more typically from the second to the first scale degree. In this example, the dominant is harmonized with a C# that resolves to D, mirroring the vocal line, but this motion is disguised by the distribution of the C# within the chord and by the use of a descending dominant seventh.

In Wilson’s manuscript and in all the other manuscripts in this study, virtually all final and important sectional cadences end with a major tonic chord, whether the song begins in a minor key or not. Wilson uses a rhythmic convention throughout for the final tonic: the bass note is struck on the first beat with the rest of chord following a beat later. It is a convention found frequently in the period, including the voluntaries for solo lute at the beginning of this manuscript and in many other lute solos and accompaniments elsewhere. It was probably understood as a clear indication of finality, like the period at the end of a sentence.
Example 2.15A, *Thus dark sett of my light*, John Wilson, Bodleian MS Mus. b.1, ff. 157r-158r, mm. 47-48:

Example 2.15B, *The wound love gave me*, John Wilson, Bodleian MS Mus. b.1, ff. 174v-175v, m. 46:
Example 2.15C, *Tu ne quaesieris*, John Wilson, Bodleian MS Mus. b.1, ff. 203r-203v, mm. 27-28:

Triple meter calls for special treatment in the accompaniment, with the breaking of whole notes into an unharmonized bass half note, followed by a chordal half note. Thus in measures one and four of example 2.16 there is an impulse on each of the three beats of the measure, allowing the accompanist to shape the rhythmic intensity of the triple meter in greater detail.

Example 2.16, *I am confirmed in my belief*, John Wilson, Bodleian MS Mus. b.1, ff. 145r, mm. 10-16:
It is worth noting the rhythmic character of these broken chords; they both lie in the resonant mid-range of the lute and do not connect to the more harmonically and melodically active measures that follow them. The tonal character of the chords is important also, with their positioning on the fingerboard aiming for maximum resonance on the lute. The A on the third course and the F on the fourth course are reinforced by a unison F on the fifth course. The result is that this chord rings all the way to the next stopped string, creating a very rich sonority. The effect of rhythmically breaking a chord with a thumb on the bass followed by fingers on the treble notes is mentioned in continuo tutors by Mace and Matteis, who were writing twenty and thirty years later, respectively.
It is particularly significant to observe this technique in tablatures from this earlier period.\textsuperscript{11} \textsuperscript{12}

The intabulated accompaniments in Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Mus. b.1 provide a wealth of stylistic inspiration for the lutenist. Perhaps the most striking feature of these realizations is their contrapuntal complexity. Many of the independent alto and tenor lines composed by Wilson would be hard to deduce from the unfigured basses, especially approaching cadences. They owe much of their melodic inventiveness to the Elizabethan lute song tradition. As in the earlier lute songs, good voice leading is maintained here, unless there is an expressive requirement for a richer or thinner texture.\textsuperscript{13} As we have seen, these contrapuntal lines can function in a variety of ways: as a vehicle for expressive dissonance, as a melodic reaction to, or an anticipation of the bass or vocal part, or as an aid to text painting. Perhaps Wilson intabulated these songs so he could control the inner voices in a manner different from what would normally be expected in a song provided only with an unfigured bass. But even if these songs represent a special, or even idealized accompaniment style, they show that a more detailed, contrapuntal approach to accompaniment could have been within the realm of expectations.

The contrapuntal nature of Wilson’s accompaniments can be examined compared to other contemporaneous genres with fully realized accompaniments. The instrumental music of William Lawes is a good choice for this, since Lawes was a lutenist-songwriter colleague of Wilson’s and an important exponent of the genre termed “fantasia-suite” by modern music historians. First cultivated by John Coprario in the early years of the

\textsuperscript{11} Mace, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 228-9.
\textsuperscript{12} Nicola Matteis, \textit{The False Consonances of Musick} (1682), ed. James Tyler, (Monaco: Editions Chanterelle S. A.), pp. 35-6.
\textsuperscript{13} While logical voice leading is generally maintained in Wilson, there are some unsatisfactory passages, like the connection between measures four and five in example 2.15. This diminished fifth would resolve correctly if Wilson’s lute had been strung with octaves in the lower courses. The transcriptions do not reflect that possibility.
The seventeenth century, the fantasia-suite flourished as private music in the homes of the patrons of Christopher Gibbons, William Lawes, and later, John Jenkins. Its style derives from the fantasy tradition for viol consort of the previous century, melded with the new early baroque experimentation with longer instrumental forms. The resulting sequence of fantasia – almaine – galliard sometimes saw the addition of other movements, and it was typically scored for violin, bass viol and organ, or two violins, viol, and organ. The fantasia-suite is significant for this study because, unlike the later baroque suite or sonata, the organ parts were fully realized with a multi-voiced contrapuntal texture that serves as an integral part of the composition.

The opening of the Fantasia from Suite No. 1 in G Minor shows the role of the organ as it states the first theme in three distinct voices and then passes it off to the violin and viol. The organ contributes middle entries of the theme in the midst of the interplay between the violin and bass viol in measures four and five. At times it reinforces the bass line played by the bass viol, whereas, elsewhere it forms an independent bass line.

Example 2.17A, *Fantasia* from Suite No. 1 in G Minor, William Lawes, p. 1, mm. 1-8, in *Musica Britannica*, vol. 60, ed. David Pinto, Stainer and Bell, 1991:

It is worth conjecturing whether the accompanimental style of the organ in these fantasia-suites is related to the elaborate accompaniments intabulated by Wilson in Bodleian Library MS Mus. b.1. They share two very important features: 1) counterpoint that is independent of the other composed voices, and 2) an idiomatic approach to setting the bass line for the lute and organ, with broken octaves, and melodic, harmonic, and rhythmic decorations. The existence of these organ realizations by William Lawes, a composer who also wrote and performed the cavalier song repertory, may indicate that Wilson’s ideal of a contrapuntal lute accompaniment was familiar to other song composers.
London, British Library MS Egerton 2013

Historians cannot agree on even an approximate date for this manuscript, but the songs contained in it are by Wilson, Lanier, the Lawes brothers, John Hilton, and others, all of whom were active in the 1630s and 1640s. Many songs are incomplete and show multiple corrections, as if the writer were attempting to write them down from memory after hearing them. Of the seventy-five songs, twenty-seven have realized lute tablature. Among the intabulated songs very few have attributions, and they usually do not appear in other collections. Compared to Wilson’s MS Mus. b.1, the lute continuo intabulations here are not contrapuntally complex; instead there is a texture of three-and four-voiced chords commonly connected by bass notes, with middle voice counterpoint occurring only at cadences. Low bass notes are rarely combined with chords, but they are sometimes struck before or after a full chord.

The manuscript has two interesting features: 1) the omission in the tablature of rhythmic signs and sometimes bar lines as we saw above in Filmer A.14, and 2) the failure to resolve leading tones at some cadences. These features are illustrated in example 2.17B:
Example 2.17B, *Silly hart, forbeare*, Nicholas Lanier, Egerton 2013, p. 72:

Transcription of mm. 1-5:

```
Silly hart forbeare, those are murbring eyes, in whose flames I sweare Cupid lur - king yes.
```

```
Cupid lurking yis, set his bowe to, set his darte, flye & flye.
```

```
then foolish hartes: 
```

```
Sil-ly hart for - beare, those are mur-bring eyes, in whose flames I sweare Cu-pid lur - king yes,
```
Like Filmer A.14, the rhythm signs were probably omitted because there was no room between the song text and the tablature. The transcription has been left without rhythmic signs to illustrate the relative ease of aligning the two parts at sight.

As to the feature of omitting resolutions from 4 to 3 in the dominant chords at some cadences, it is possible that this is either another example of a scribe’s shorthand or a stylistic decision. The omission of the resolution may be a conscious decision to give the singer the freedom to resolve the cadence at his or her leisure, perhaps with an added ornamental flourish. In example 2.17B, the cadence at the end of the first section (fourth measure of the transcription) omits the resolution, suspending the 4 throughout the measure. It is resolved to 3 in the vocal part, so all the harmony is complete. There are six examples of this avoidance of resolution within the twenty-seven intabulated songs that do not occur in consistent structural locations within the songs. While this type of non-resolution in the accompaniment is not common, it is found in other sources. An early example, predating the period of the cavalier song by 30 or 40 years, is found in the opening measures of I saw my lady weepe by John Dowland. The editorial figures in the transcription illustrate how the lute accompaniment sets up a suspension on the dominant that is resolved by the voice.

Example 2.18, *I saw my Lady weep*, John Dowland, *Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*, p. 1, mm. 1-6:

Transcription of mm. 3-6:
Manuscripts with tablature accompaniments

suitable for theorbo with the first course tuned down an octave

Lambeth Palace Library MS 1041 (*Lady Ann Blount Song Book*)\(^{16}\)

This manuscript, copied ca. 1650-60, contains twenty-nine songs, many in the hand of Charles Coleman (ca. 1605-64). The tablature realizations show that instruments with two different tunings could have been used; a theorbo with thirteen courses and a low first course, or a lute with at least ten courses. Lambeth Palace MS 1041 shows a more international flavor than those studied above, containing twenty-one songs in English, eight in French, and three in Italian. Compositional style of the vocal part varies according to nationality, with Italian diminutions in the Italian and some of the English songs, in contrast to decoration with graces and fewer diminutions in the style of the *air de cour* for the French songs. Since the topic of this paper is the accompaniment of English song, the French and Italian songs in this manuscript will not be discussed in detail. Let it suffice to mention that the French songs use the broken chords, or *style brisé* found in the solo lute music of Ballard, the Gautiers and other French lutenist composers. Simple chords are broken rhythmically throughout the course of a phrase and then struck without arpeggiation at cadences.

---

Example 2.19, *Je ne cognois que trop*, Michel Lambert, Lambeth Palace MS 1041, ff. 9v, 11r-11v, mm. 1-9:

Example 2.19 probably fits best on a 10-course lute with a high top string. The song includes markings not encountered earlier in this study: dots by tablature figures to indicate left-hand fingerings, slurs in the vocal part to group some syllables, and slurs in
the lute part to indicate notes that should be allowed to ring on. The French songs in this manuscript are stylistically related to the *airs de cour* found in France between 1603 and 1643, which were published with tablature accompaniments, rather than figured or unfigured bass. This *style brisé* does not seem to be applied to English songs in any of the manuscripts studied here except in Broxbourne and in the solitary English song in Filmer A.14. The presence of some songs using *style brisé* indicates that some English musicians were aware of it. Chapter III will show that Thomas Mace used *style brisé* frequently in his theorbo examples in *Musick’s Monument*, an indication that it could have been a popular accompanimental style in some circles.

The Italian songs in the Lambeth Palace MS seem to work best using the theorbo tuning, with the first course sounding down an octave. Of the three Italian songs, one is partially in declamatory style and the other two are lighter *canzonette*. The declamatory opening of *O mia Fili gradita* is of particular interest because it provides an intabulation of a slow moving bass line typical of an Italian *lamento*. The first phrase of the song repeats the same harmony six times, with only the octave of the bass note being varied.

Example 2.20, *O mia Fili gradita*, Anonymous, Lambeth Palace MS 1041, f. 53v, mm. 1-6:
One must wonder if this chord would be repeated as plainly as it is notated here, or if rolling the chord at various speeds or variation of spacing would have been expected in performance, with the tablature simply serving as an indication of the harmony. The simplicity of example 2.20 is in direct contrast to the harmonic sophistication of the cadences, such as the one in below in example 2.21. Compared to the cadences from the John Wilson manuscript examined in examples 2.15A, B, and C, these cadences are more harmonically complex, using the 6/4 chord and the dominant seventh in various combinations. They are also more contrapuntally active, with some occasional doubling of the vocal melody.
Example 2.21, *O mia fili gradita*, Anonymous, Lambeth Palace MS 1041, f. 53r, mm. 16-17:

Transcription:

This song should be studied in detail as a source for accompanying Italian song, but like the French songs in this manuscript, it represents a departure from the style of the English songs of this period. The English songs in general have far fewer static harmonies; they tend to introduce counterpoint above slow-moving bass notes, as we have seen above. However, it is clear from this example that the declamatory style was known in England, and the repeated publication of Caccini’s instructions for singing from his *Le Nuove Musiche* (1602) by John Playford in his *An Introduction to the Skill of Musick* bear this
out. Playford included these, translated into English as “Instructions for Singing After the Italian Manner,” in reprints from 1664 to 1694.¹⁷

We turn now to the English songs in Lambeth Palace MS 1041, the main thrust of this research. These song accompaniments are similar to those in the John Wilson manuscript in that they employ some carefully composed counterpoint in the middle voices of the accompaniment, but they also make more frequent use of simple parallel tenths and sixths between the bass and the alto and incorporate some block chords. In addition, there are two features not shared with any of the previously discussed manuscripts:

1. The top voice of the accompaniment occasionally doubles the vocal part, as in the opening phrase of *Goe thy way since thou wilt goe*.

Example 2.22, *Goe thy way since thou wilt goe*, Anonymous, Lambeth Palace MS 1041, f. 5r, mm. 1-5:

Transcription:

The doubling of important notes of the melody is disguised somewhat by the octave transposition of the first course, but is still evident to the listener. This is an option often neglected by modern accompanists reading from a continuo bass, even though many period continuo writings do not discourage it except in the case of the verbatim doubling for an extended period. This doubling technique is used sparingly and effectively in Lambeth Palace MS 1041. Sometimes a short motive accompanied in unison will be followed immediately with accompaniment at parallel sixths or tenths, or a moment of harmonic interest will be doubled, like seventh and sixth of a 7-6 half cadence. In the case of example 2.22, the doubled opening passage is contrasted with the remainder of the song, in which the bass line imitates the vocal line at a distance of two quarter notes. The use of doubling is carefully regulated whenever it is used; it is not a student’s mistake.

2. Of all the manuscripts studied, Lambeth Palace MS 1041 uses the greatest variety of textures throughout the course of a single song. In *Beate on proud billows; Boreas, blow!*, a setting by poet Roger L’Estrange about an imprisoned royalist, these texture changes are used for dramatic effect, creating a different affect for each line of text. In order to show these contrasts clearly, the song is quoted in full below:
Example 2.23, *Beate on proud billows, Boreas, blow!,* Anonymous, Lambeth Palace MS 1041, ff. 6v-7r:
Through most of the first two lines of poetry, “Beat on proud billows, Boreas, blow;/
Swell curled waves, high as Jove's roof,” the accompaniment consists of four- and five-
note chords, which could be performed by playing the bass with the thumb and raking
back over the treble courses with the index finger, a technique described by Mersenne.¹⁸

¹⁸ Marin Mersenne, *Harmonie Universelle, the Books on Instruments* (1635), trans. Roger E. Chapman,
This sweeping effect could portray the beating waves. The text, “Your incivility will show
/That innocence is tempest-proof” is set first with an alto line in unison to the voice,
followed by a measure of unharmonized bass and then a cadence in only two parts. This
lighter texture has the effect of separating these lines of text from the first two. “Though
surly Nereus frown, my thoughts are calm” is set in a low two-part texture to portray
calmness. The final lines, “Then strike, affliction, for thy wounds are balm,” are set with
an unharmonized scale starting on the lowest string of the lute. It is easy to imagine the
first two notes played with a sharp sound near the bridge of the lute, to mirror the “strike”
of affliction. Twelve other strophes follow, most of which are not as well-suited to the
music as the setting given for the first verse. It is likely that the accompanist would change
some features of the accompaniment to make it serve the subsequent verses better.

The final four pages of the manuscript consist of rules for realizing continuo on
theorbo. A bass line without figures is provided with a tablature realization on a separate
staff below it. The exercises consist of scales in thirds, harmonized scales using 6/3-5/3
and 5/3-6/3 progressions, progressions with bass motion by third, fourth, and fifth,
standard cadences, and first inversion chords. The tablature generally favors the voice-
leading possibilities of an instrument with a lowered first course and, like some of the
French treatises on continuo realization published from 1660 to 1720, it occasionally
allows notes on the first course to sound below the bass.19 Although the table is intended
for a student, it is a useful reference for anyone wanting to learn the chord shapes specific
to the English theorbo with reentrant tuning of the first course only.

19 For a discussion of this issue see: Kevin Mason, “Francois Campion’s Secret of Accompaniment for the
**Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Broxbourne 84.9**

This manuscript, probably copied between 1650 and 1663 by Charles Coleman, contains twelve secular songs and three psalm settings. Like Lambeth Palace 1041, it is an international collection, with ten vocal compositions in English, four in Italian, one in French, and an instrumental *folia* for theorbo. Composers include Henry and William Lawes, Nicholas Lanier, Coleman himself, and François de Chancy. The Italian songs are anonymous. Unlike Lambeth Palace 1041, the pieces in each of the three languages are not accompanied in dramatically different styles; the approach is much more uniform. All of the accompaniments can be played on a theorbo with at least thirteen courses with re-entrant first course, although a few specific passages seem to work better with a high first course.

The accompaniments in Broxbourne 84.9 generally emphasize rhythm and sonority over counterpoint and voice leading. The low range of the theorbo is used throughout with the bass placed on diapasons for almost every chord. Textures are very rich, with usually four or more notes in every chord on a strong beat. As a general rule, full chords are placed on strong syllables to support the natural accentuation of the text. The accompaniment is mostly homophonic, except at cadences when the routine patterns emerge, or when the vocal part is occasionally doubled at a third or sixth. This manuscript preserves an approach that is familiar to modern players where sonority reinforces the accentuation of the text. This is a very different style from manuscripts such as Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Mus. b.1 (John Wilson manuscript) where counterpoint from the Golden Age lute song tradition had a strong influence.
Chords are used rhythmically in several different ways. They can be broken both to sustain the sound and to create syncopation against the voice. Example 2.24 from *I’m sick of love* accomplishes both of these goals by breaking a chord after its bass is struck in measure one, followed by sustained chords in measures two and three.

Example 2.24, *I’m sick of love*, William Lawes, Broxbourne 84.9, ff. 6v-7r, mm. 1-4:

Chords can also be restruck with a raking back of the index finger. Gordon Callon, who recently edited this manuscript, theorizes that the short vertical bar that appears after full chords in songs number eight and ten could indicate this technique. Example 2.25 from *Je ne puis éviter* shows written out chord voicing that would be appropriate for this technique on beats two and three of each measure.
Example 2.25, *Je ne puis éviter*, François de Chancy, Broxbourne 84.9, ff. 4v-5r, mm.12-15:

Examples 2.24 and 2.25 show rhythmic activity that is used both to highlight the vocal part with syncopation and sustain the sound of the lute, but Broxbourne 84.9 also contains many harmonic niceties that heighten important moments in the texts. Some of this activity occurs at cadences, as in *Oft have I sworn*, song number ten:

Example 2.26, *Oft have I sworn*, Henry Lawes, Broxbourne 84.9, ff. 7v-8r, mm. 15-17:
Shifting the harmony between minor and major above the same written pitch in the bass is used for expressive purposes in example 2.27 from song number six, *How cool and temperate*. The words “cool” and “temperate” are treated with D minor and D major chords respectively.

Example 2.27, *How cool and temp’rate*, Henry Lawes, Broxbourne 84.9, ff. 5v-6r, mm. 1-3:

In addition to the harmonic coloring, this example shows an important stylistic element that prevails throughout the manuscript – the accenting of the natural stresses of the text with full chords, while supporting unaccented words with more spare chords. For example, “cool” is strong and receives a four-note chord, “and” is harmonized with a single note, “tem-p’rate” gets a full chord on its first syllable, and “am” gets only a two-note chord. This practice of text accentuation with full chords of four or more voices and giving either nothing or else a very light chord for weak syllables is familiar to many modern continuo performers because it is documented in many period sources. Most of the accompaniments in Broxbourne 84.9 support this practice.
Sometimes a choice of voice leading, rather than harmonic content or chordal accent, is used to create a special effect. There are some deceptive cadences in the manuscript, where a cadence is set up with a 4-3 suspension and then resolved in an unexpected way, but example 2.28 from song number four, *Fuggi, fuggi, fuggi, diletta amante*, heightens this surprise by resolving in parallel fifths and octaves. This choice of voice leading does not seem to be accidental and perfectly expresses the word, “crudele”.

Example 2.28, *Fuggi, fuggi, fuggi, diletta amante*, Anonymous, Broxbourne 84.9, f. 4r, mm 5-6:

It is not clear why only one song from the manuscript, *S’io morro, che dira*, has ornament signs in the accompaniment. Perhaps one was marked with signs as an example of how to play the others. The symbols used include “x” which, in context, could mean a shake either up or down, “,” for a fore-fall or back-fall, and “.,x” for a combination of the two. Other signs, for which no meaning is readily discernable, include a fermata placed usually on short notes, and “.” and “…”, placed directly under chords and single tablature
figures. They do not seem to be left hand fingerings, because they are often placed under open strings\textsuperscript{20}

### Summary

**Observations About Instrumentation**

Before proceeding to a summary of stylistic observations, it is appropriate to address some of the issues of instrumentation that emerged in the preceding analysis. The cavalier songs survive in print or manuscript in three different configurations: 1) vocal line and bass line in mensural notation (the most common), 2) vocal line and tablature (less common), and 3) vocal line, tablature, and bass line in mensural notation (in two manuscripts only). It is clear that many lutenists were realizing song accompaniments from mensural bass lines from the beginning of the seventeenth century, while some were still intabulating accompaniments, but other instruments – most notably the viola da gamba – were also used to accompany. It is important to address how the viol might have been used in an accompanimental situation in order to understand fully the lute’s role. The possible combination of lute with another instrument is of particular importance, since this would greatly affect the character of the accompaniment.

While two manuscripts, MS Don.c.57 and MS Mus.b.1 (John Wilson), both have a separate bass line either under or near the lute tablature accompaniment, this in itself does not make a strong case for the lute and viol being used simultaneously. On pages 11 to 14 above chapter where Don.c.57 was treated, it was observed that the added bass line probably served as a device for transposition, since all of the songs in nominal A tuning

\textsuperscript{20} Callon, *op. cit.*, pp. xviii-xix.
had the mensural bass added. A lutenist could have used this mensural bass to realize a version of the song down one tone. The bass line has the added benefit of requiring less space than a fully intabulated transposed part. Similarly, the mensural bass line included under the tablature realization in MS Mus. b.1 does not persuade us that lute and viol were used together. In example 2.11 on pages 36 and 37 it is shown that the lute intabulation and the mensural bass line could never have been played together because figuration in the tablature runs in parallel fifths to the bass line. In other places, the mensural bass line and the bass of the tablature frequently diverge from each other and result in dissonances that serve no musical purpose. The intabulated bass line in the lute realization capitalizes on the idiom of the lute, departing from it most notably by restriking long notes, and by adding passing and connecting notes not included in the mensural bass line. As in Don.c.57, the mensural bass lines in MS Mus. b.1 might have been an aid for transposition, or might have been realized by a solitary bass viol player.

The title pages for printed song collections from the period give information about the instrumentation of song accompaniments. These titles clearly identified the instruments that can be used to accompany, and in the spirit of aggressive marketing, tended to mention multiple instrumental options in order to entice the greatest possible number of purchasers. For that reason they might not provide proof of what was practiced, but at least they show some possibilities. The Golden Age lute song practice, while stylistically different in terms of contrapuntal complexity, defined the lute’s role as the primary instrument for accompaniment of the cavalier songs. Some of the Golden Age lute song prints indicated that the viol could have been used with instruments of the lute family (this author’s bolding):
The first book of Songs or Ayres of 4. parts: with Tableture for the Lute or Orpherian, with the Violl de Gamba. Newly composed by Francis Pilkington. London: Printed by T. Este [etc.] 1605

and:

A Musickal Dreame. Or The Fourth Booke Of Ayres, The First part is for the Lute, two Voyces, and the Viole de Gambo; The Second part is for the Lute, the Viole and foure Voices to Sing: The Third part is for one Voyce alone, or to the Lute, the Basse Viole, or to both if you please, Whereof, two are Italian Ayres. Composed by Robert Iones. London: Imprinted by the Assignes of William Barley [etc.] 1609

We know that the viol could have stood on its own for song accompaniments in the Golden Age, based on the publications of songs for voice with viol tablature by Tobias Hume and from written accounts of the practice. The following title pages indicate that viols could play a chordal “lira” accompaniment, possibly even reading lute tablature:

The first and the second booke of songs and ayres, Set out to the Lute, the base Violl the playne way, or the Base by tableture after the leero fashion: Composed by Robert Iones. Printed by P. S. for Mathew Selman by the assent of Thomas Morley [etc.] 1601

This evidence establishes that the viol was possibly used both together with the lute and separately from the lute in this repertory. Later in the century, title pages indicated that the lute and viol’s roles were separate, and list the lute or theorbo as the first choice, with the viol as an alternative, not an optional extra instrument, as in the following:

21 Tobias Hume published two collections, The First Part of Ayres (London: John Windet, 1605) and Captain Humes Poeticall Musicke (London: John Windet, 1607).
Select Musicall Ayres, and dialogues, For one and two Voyces, to sing to the Theorbo, Lute, or Basse Violl. Composed by John Wilson, Charles Colman, Doctours of Musick. Henry Lawes, William Webb, Gentlemen. To which is added some few short Ayres or Songs for three Voyces, to an Instrument. London: Printed for John Playford [etc.] 1652.

Matthew Spring lists the English printed song collections and their title pages from 1613 to 1727, and all forty-five publications indicate that one instrument at a time is used for accompaniment, not multiple instruments. For the fourteen printed song collections between 1620 and 1670, the period of the cavalier song, all mention lute, theorbo, or theorbo-lute, while eleven mention the viol as an option. The harpsichord is mentioned four times; the organ three times.\(^\text{23}\) This seems to be overwhelming evidence in support of the idea that instruments acted alone when they accompanied the cavalier song repertory, whether they were lute, theorbo, viol, or keyboard. If there had been any need to reinforce the soft bass range of the lute with the bass viol in the earlier songs, this would have been resolved when the theorbo gained in popularity since its strong basses would not have needed any extra support.

---

\(^{23}\) Spring, pp. 388-89.
Summary of Stylistic Characteristics of the Accompaniments:

The analysis of the eight intabulated song manuscripts has revealed a rich language of stylistic approaches. Some synthesis is necessary to identify the most important features of the accompaniments, since not all of the manuscripts should be given equal weight, due to the goals and abilities of the scribes. While the student manuscripts reveal much about the learning process, the works of the master composer/performers – Wilson and Coleman – deserve more attention.

The Scribes and Their Goals

Of the eight manuscripts, Drexel 4175, Oxford f.575, Bodleian Don.c.57, and Egerton 2013 are best described as the works of beginners or intermediate students; Filmer A.14 requires more advanced ability, while the John Wilson manuscript, Lambeth Palace 1041, and Broxbourne 84.9 are clearly the works of professional musicians with some songs autographed by a known composer. The various scribes had different capabilities and goals in preserving their accompaniments. Some of the beginning level manuscripts are quite neat, perhaps showing the results of carefully worked out intabulations provided by a teacher, while others show the errors and corrections inherent in the learning process. Filmer A.14 seems to be a document for actual performance, with multiple verses intabulated and some carefully inserted introductions and interludes. The John Wilson manuscript is of presentation quality, offering his ideal accompaniments, while Lambeth Palace 1041 and Broxbourne 84.9 seem to be the books of advanced students who may have worked directly with the lutenist songwriter Charles Coleman. It is essential that a modern performer view the manuscripts from the perspective of their scribes’ goals, abilities, and intentions. While much can be learned about the scribe’s musical education
from examining the beginning and intermediate works, they should not draw too much
attention away from the masterworks of this period, the songs of Wilson and Coleman.

**Songs in Other Languages**

Some of the manuscripts include songs with texts in Italian and French, as well as
many in English, which attests to the importance of stylistic influences from these
continental countries. Filmer A.14, Lambeth Palace 1041 and Broxbourne 84.9 are
international in character, with songs in English, French, Italian, and, in the case of
Filmer, Latin. The John Wilson manuscript includes Latin odes. The use of techniques
such as broken chords, strumming and raking with the index finger have their roots in the
French *air de cour* tradition, while notating a simple harmony under a declamatory vocal
line seems to be related to Italian song. While the presence of these techniques shows that
English musicians were becoming familiar with new accompanimental styles used in
French and Italian song, this does not mean they would necessarily have applied them in
all circumstances to English song. This separation of national styles can be seen most
clearly in Lambeth Palace 1041, which presents French songs with broken chords and
Italian songs with full, often stationary chords, but reserves a more contrapuntal style for
the English songs.
Notational Conventions

Some notational conventions in the manuscripts give an indication of the ordering of the elements of the songs and their relative importance in the mind of the scribe. The equal, natural spacing of the text suggests that it was probably copied first, with the vocal melody and accompaniment added later. In the case of Filmer A.14 and Egerton 2013, rhythmic notation in the accompaniment was omitted due to a lack of room between the text and the lower staff, perhaps indicating a flexible or, at least, subservient relationship of the rhythm of the lute part to the text and vocal line. In Bodleian Mus. Sch. f.575, the bar lines were omitted in three of the ten songs because the shape of the melodic line and the text would have provided all the information necessary for a good performance on the part of the accompanist. Perhaps when the scribe had relayed enough information to recall or archive the song, he/she stopped writing. The ordering of text, vocal melody, and accompaniment revealed by these seemingly incomplete manuscripts can help modern performers understand priority when approaching these songs.

The notational convention of nominal tuning can create confusion, but once clarified, it can simplify performance. Bodleian Mus. Sch. f.575, Bodleian Don.c.57, Filmer A.14, and, possibly, Lambeth Palace 1041 all contain some songs in nominal A tuning in which the vocal part is written one tone above the sounding key of the lute part. Players simply need to know that multiple instruments in different keys are not indicated, rather that the vocalist would transpose to match the pitch of the accompaniment instrument.

Texture, Range, and Disposition of the Accompaniment

In some regards, these issues are related to the tuning and construction of the lutes, whether 10-course lute in Renaissance tuning, 12-course lute in Renaissance tuning, or
theorbo with up to thirteen courses with re-entrant tuning of the first course. These types of instrument offer different possibilities of range and sonority. A comparison of the features of texture, range, and disposition will provide some guidelines for styles of accompaniment on the various lutes. The manuscripts for 10-course lute – Drexel 4175, Bodleian f.575, Bodleian Don. c.57, and Filmer A.14 – show some similarities in range and disposition, but display important variations in texture. The first three generally present chords on adjacent upper strings in a block texture (all notes struck at once), punctuated with simple counterpoint like parallel thirds and typical 4-3 suspensions at cadences. They vary in their use of the low bass courses, with Drexel 4175 and Bodleian f.575 only occasionally reaching below the seventh course, usually to sustain a harmony from a previous chord. Bodleian Don. c.57 is different from these two manuscripts in that it integrates the basses below the seventh course into the chordal texture. Passages of parallel thirds and cadences are also combined with lower basses.

Of the four 10-course lute manuscripts, Filmer A.14 takes the most significant departure from the characteristics described above. It uses style brisé chords in a texture similar to the French air de cour accompaniments. Bass notes, sometimes on the lowest courses, are either followed or preceded by chords on adjacent strings on the first through fourth courses. These chords could be played by raking up with the index finger, although there is no direct indication to do so, as there is in some of the later theorbo manuscripts. This rhythmic, broken chord style is alternated with a lighter texture, often in only two parts. In terms of the range, certain songs avoid use of the first course, a feature of some of the 12-course lute and theorbo accompaniments.
Of the four 10-course lute manuscripts, only Drexel 4175 has ornament signs. Four distinct signs appear in some frequency, and they are similar to those described by Robinson and Mace. Aside from a few markings in one song in Broxbourne 84.9, none of the other theorbo manuscripts contain signs for ornaments, which indicates either that accompaniments were generally less ornamented compared to the solo lute repertory, or that ornaments were left to the accompanist’s discretion.

Of the two 12-course lute accompaniments, the John Wilson manuscript shows a wealth of textural variations, while Egerton 2013 presents only block chord texture with the occasional addition of some low bass notes, much like the early 10-course accompaniments described above. There is infrequent use of the first course, and the instances of its use make it difficult to be sure about this course’s tuning – whether high as in Renaissance tuning, low as in re-entrant theorbo tuning, or possibly in octaves. The overall range used in the John Wilson manuscript favors the middle and low registers of the lute. Chords are often voiced very low, with bass notes on the lowest courses and other chord tones on the fifth through second courses. The texture of the accompaniment varies frequently, and it is generally marked by a contrapuntal complexity akin to that of the Golden Age lute song repertory and the organ parts in the fantasia suites of William Lawes and his contemporaries. The accompaniments contain at least one melodically significant voice, in addition to the bass, which can function in a variety of ways: 1) movement parallel to the melody, 2) movement parallel to the bass, 3) free counterpoint with some harmonically-conceived accents, and 4) pictorial descriptions of the text involving ascent or descent. The bass line can also become a new, independent voice, sometimes taking on a new melodic character, or establishing a pedal point below the melodic bass. In addition to counterpoint, Wilson uses textures already described above, such as block chords and
broken chords. Block chords appear in some declamatory sections and broken chords underscore the rhythm in songs with a strong triple time dance character. The John Wilson manuscript exhibits the widest range of textures and has the strongest emphasis on counterpoint.

The two manuscripts for theorbo with the first course probably at the lower octave, Lambeth Palace 1041 and Broxbourne 84.9, show some of the distinctive features associated with the construction of the theorbo: emphasis on the low basses and relatively little use of the first course. Whereas in Broxbourne 84.9, the tablature accompaniments clearly indicate the lowered first course in all but a few instances, Lambeth Palace 1041 is less consistent, suggesting that either two differently tuned instruments were used, or that there were octaves on the first course, as was suggested above as a possible solution for the John Wilson manuscript. A third possibility, and one that might apply to many of the manuscripts, is that there could have been a certain disregard for the rules of voice leading on the part of the scribe or composer concerning the tuning of the first course. The accompaniments work reasonably well, no matter what the tuning of the first course, with many voice leading inconsistencies being masked by the singer. This ambiguity in the manuscripts should inspire modern players to experiment on the instruments and tunings readily available to them, since seventeenth century musicians were apparently not too rigid about this subject.

While both of the theorbo manuscripts are international in character and include songs in English, French, and Italian, they treat the nationalities differently: Lambeth Palace 1041 reserves distinctive accompanimental textures for each language, while Broxbourne 84.9 has a much more uniform texture throughout. The English songs in Lambeth Palace 1041 use simple counterpoint of thirds and sixths against the bass and sometimes double
the voice; the Italian songs use slow moving or repeated chords to accompany in the
declamatory style; and the French songs use the *style brisé* seen in Filmer A.14 and in
parts of the John Wilson manuscript. Like the John Wilson manuscript, Lambeth Palace
1041 sometimes changes textures rapidly, alternating between block chords, simple
counterpoint, doubling the vocal melody, and a *tasto solo* bass line, sometimes all in the
course of one song. The more uniform texture of the accompaniment style in Broxbourne
84.9 emphasizes rich chords of four or more notes combined with deep basses. While
there are many instances of block chords, chords are often broken, sometimes with the
bass struck first followed by a full chord, possibly played by raking up with the index
finger. The most significant aspect of the texture in Broxbourne 84.9 is the care that is
taken to emphasize important words in the text. As previously noted, strong syllables often
receive the richest chords, while weaker syllables are treated with a lighter texture, and of
all the manuscripts Broxbourne 84.9 is the most sensitive to the issue of text accent.

**Harmonic Features**

While a full discussion of the harmonic language of the cavalier songs will be
presented in chapter three, it is worth noting some special harmonic features that stand out
as elements of style. Chapter three will describe the relatively simple harmonic language
for the cavalier songs, made up of 5/3 chords, 6/3 chords, occasional 7-6 suspensions, and
4-3 suspensions with some seventh chords at cadences. In addition to this straightforward
harmonic framework, the analysis of the intabulated accompaniments has revealed some
unusual passages that serve expressive purposes.
In the case of the John Wilson manuscript, suspensions of 4 resolving to 3 are often used as melodic appoggiaturas, as in example 2.12. This 4-3 movement (similar to his use of 7-6 suspensions), has the effect of drawing attention to an important moment in either the vocal melody or the text. Sometimes they are used within the context of root position chords, but they can appear as an ornament of a 6/3 chord, producing an harmonic appoggiatura of 6/4 to 6/3. This feature seems to appear only in the John Wilson manuscript. Another irregularity used for a special effect in Broxbourne 84.9 is the sudden shift from a major chord to its parallel minor to emphasize a change of mood. This manuscript also has one example of parallel motion between all voices connecting two chords a half step apart. Created by sliding a chord shape up the neck of the theorbo somewhat in the manner of a jazz guitarist, the effect is quite jarring and is used to accentuate a special word. These harmonic niceties are not a constant presence; they always serve a specific expressive purpose, and they should be used by the modern player with discretion.

While the manuscripts show a variety of ways of treating cadences at the ends of major sections, most use some of the same harmonic elements, such as a 4-3 suspension over the dominant chord followed by a falling seventh. The differences between cadences in the manuscripts are mostly rhythmic. Harmonically they generally rely on variations of 4-3 or 3-4-4-3 movement above the dominant chord. They range from simple half and quarter note motion in Bodleian f.575, to the elaborately broken chords, borrowed minor subdominants, and dominant pedal points in the John Wilson manuscript. Egerton 2013 has a cadential variation worth noting, an unresolved 4-3 cadence. The 4 is struck in the dominant chord and is sustained, unresolved, until to the final chord, allowing the
dissonance to ring on to create tension until the last possible moment, and giving the singer the freedom to make the resolution.

The Relationship of the Songs to Other Content and Features of the Manuscripts

Some manuscripts contain music other than songs with intabulated accompaniments. The presence of this other material can give an indication of the relative position of the intabulated songs within the scope of the scribe’s musical interests. Drexel 4175 includes several intabulated songs specifying viol accompaniment, suggesting that the scribe may have played both instruments and reinforcing the theory that the viol could accompany on its own as a chordal instrument. Bodleian 575 also indicates the close association of the lute with other instruments, containing eighty-five pieces for lyra viol and five pieces for keyboard, in addition to the ten intabulated lute songs. Bodleian Don.c.57 places the intabulated songs at the end of a book of songs with unfigured bass. Also at the end is a chord chart showing tablature solutions to chords suggested by mensural bass lines. The songs in mensural notation were probably copied first, and the intabulated songs and chord chart could have served as examples for creating accompaniments. This is a reminder that the art of continuo accompaniment was still new in early seventeenth-century England and that players were making a transition from intabulated lute song to continuo.

As previously stated, the John Wilson manuscript is a very special case, copied as a presentation piece for his academic appointment to Oxford. It probably contains refined versions of his best work, and includes chordal studies, voluntaries for solo lute in a variety of keys, 188 songs with mensural bass accompaniment and thirty-eight intabulated songs. While Wilson was probably proficient in continuo accompaniment, he clearly valued the genre of intabulated song as an lutenist of the post-Elizabethan era. His
intabulated songs were in no way an amateur’s solution to the new continuo practice, but examples that he felt were worthy of notating and preserving. Egerton 2013, like the John Wilson manuscript, has a mixture of twenty-seven intabulated songs and forty-eight with the bass line in mensural notation, but the multiple corrections in the tablature show that the lutenist was struggling with the new continuo practice. The theorbo manuscripts, Lambeth Palace 1041 and Broxbourne 84.9, both show the hand of Charles Coleman and contain many intabulated songs; beyond that, Broxbourne 84.9 contains only a short folia for theorbo, while Lambeth Palace 1041 has an elaborate four-page table of chords and, added in a later hand, a group of songs with a bass line in pitch notation. The table of chords is very methodical, treating scales, standard progressions, bass movement by various intervals, and cadences. The table’s thorough construction and the high quality of the realized song accompaniments show that the manuscript was probably used by one of Coleman’s advanced students or another professional musician.

The intabulated song manuscripts are the logical place to begin for modern lute players as they work out their own accompaniments for the cavalier songs, yet of the many songs from this period in manuscript and print, only a very small percentage have intabulated lute parts; most have only an unfigured mensural bass line. While it is to some extent a leap of faith to assume that the stylistic features contained in the specimen pieces outlined above can always be applied to this vast repertory, there is at least proof that some standard styles of accompaniment existed and that some were valued enough to be written down. The stylistic variations that appear in the manuscripts provide the modern lutenist with a broad vocabulary for experimentation. At the same time, some limits and guidance can be gleaned when instrumentation, tuning, experience of the scribe/composer, and the influence of competing national styles are taken into account.